

Bristol City Council

Minutes of the Full Council

10 September 2019 at 6.00 pm



Members Present:-

Councillors: Lord Mayor Councillor Jos Clark, Mayor Marvin Rees, Peter Abraham, Donald Alexander, Lesley Alexander, Nicola Bowden-Jones, Mark Bradshaw, Charlie Bolton, Tom Brook, Fabian Breckels, Tony Carey, Craig Cheney, Barry Clark, Jos Clark, Harriet Clough, Eleanor Combley, Asher Craig, Mike Davies, Carla Denyer, Kye Dudd, Richard Eddy, Martin Fodor, Helen Godwin, Geoff Gollop, John Goulandris, Fi Hance, Margaret Hickman, Claire Hiscott, Helen Holland, Gary Hopkins, Chris Jackson, Hibaq Jama, Carole Johnson, Anna Keen, Tim Kent, Sultan Khan, Cleo Lake, Jeff Lovell, Brenda Massey, Olly Mead, Matt Melias, Graham Morris, Anthony Negus, Paula O'Rourke, Steve Pearce, Celia Phipps, Ruth Pickersgill, Kevin Quartley, Jo Sergeant, Afzal Shah, Steve Smith, Paul Smith, Clive Stevens, Estella Tincknell, Jon Wellington, Mark Weston, Lucy Whittle, Chris Windows and Mark Wright

Aldermen: C Orlik, A Massey, J McLaren, J Smith, C J Williams, S Williams,

1. Welcome, Introductions and Safety Information

The Lord Mayor welcomed all attendees to the meeting, and made a safety announcement in relation to the fire/emergency evacuation procedure.

2. Apologies for Absence

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors Beech, Bradley, Clarke, C Davies, English, Goggin, S Jones, Kirk, Langley, Radford, Thomas and Threlfall.

3. Minutes of the Previous Meeting

On the motion of the Lord Mayor, seconded by Councillor Kent, it was

RESOLVED:

That the minutes of the meeting of the Full Council held on the 16 July 2019 be confirmed as correct record and signed by the Lord Mayor.



4. Declarations of Interest

None received.

5. Lord Mayor's Business

Dr Ann Kennard

The Lord Mayor congratulated Dr Ann Kennard on being awarded a medal by the German Government in part for her work as Chair of the Hannover Twinning Associations for the past twenty years.

Alderman Mervyn Hulin

The Lord Mayor informed Full Council of the recent death of former Bristol City Councillor, Alderman Mervyn Hulin.

Councillors Holland and Abraham addressed Full Council, paying tribute in remembrance of Alderman Hulin.

The Full Council then observed a minute's silence in memory of Alderman Hulin.

6. Public Forum (Public Petitions, Statements and Questions)

Public petitions:

There were no public petitions received.

Public statements:

The Full Council received and noted the following statements (which were also referred to the Mayor for his consideration/information):

| Ref No | Name | Title |
|--------|---|------------------------------|
| PS01 | Amber Eastman | 5G |
| PS02 | David Mullaney | Blaise Parking Charges |
| PS03 | Oliver Fortune | Bristol Airport Expansion |
| PS03a | Karen Churchill | 5G |
| PS04 | Paul Tasman | Green New Deal |
| PS05 | Steve Shaw, Riverside Garden Centre Ltd | Western Harbour Road Schemes |



| | | |
|------|--|--|
| PS06 | Judith Brown, Bristol Older People's Forum | Post-Brexit Medication Supplies |
| PS07 | Sue Hollyman/Fiona Evans | Stoke Lodge Field |
| PS08 | Andrew Varney | BCC Consultations |
| PS09 | Kevin Gummet | Canford Road Crossing |
| PS10 | Robert Clarke | 5G |
| PS11 | Sangeetha Wynter | School Funding |
| PS12 | Jen Smith | Special Educational Needs and Disabilities |
| PS13 | Helen Powell | Stoke Lodge Playing Fields |
| PS14 | Julie Boston | Public Toilets |
| PS15 | Louise Thomas | 5G |
| PS16 | Graham Donald | Canford Lane Crossing |
| PS17 | Monique Sapla | Climate Emergency |
| PS18 | Eileen Means | Local Train Services |
| PS19 | Susan Mayer | Stoke Lodge Playing Fields |
| PS20 | * withdrawn | |
| PS21 | Mobile UK | 5G |
| PS22 | Mary Page | Independent Remuneration Panel report |
| PS23 | John S Andrews - Extinction Rebellion | Pension Divestment |
| PS24 | Sarah Menage | 5G |
| PS25 | Sue Geary | Stoke Bishop Playing Fields |

Within the time available, statements were presented by individuals present at the meeting.

Public Questions:

The Full Council noted that the following questions had been submitted:

| Ref No | Name | Title |
|-------------|--------------------|--|
| PQ01 | Judith Brown | Public Toilets in our Parks |
| PQ02 | Jon Eccles | Netham Park |
| PQ03 & PQ04 | Amber Eastman | 5G |
| PQ05 & PQ06 | Bristol Tree Forum | Tree Preservation Orders at Stoke Lodge Playing Fields |



| | | |
|-------------|-------------------------|--|
| PQ07 | Lee Starr-Elliott | Impact of No Deal Brexit |
| PQ08 | Aileen McLoughlin | Green New Deal |
| PQ09 | Kathy Welham | Stoke Lodge Field |
| PQ10 | Oliver Fortune | Bristol Airport Expansion |
| PQ11 | Oliver Fortune | Clean Air Zones |
| PQ12 | Riverside Garden Centre | Riverside Garden Centre |
| PQ13 & PQ14 | Michael Owen | Cumberland Basin |
| PQ15 | Tim Rippington | Callington Link Road |
| PQ16 & PQ17 | Edward Bowditch | Railway Employment |
| PQ18 | Mary Page | Low emissions vehicles and charging hubs |
| PQ19 | Paul Bullivant | BOSA |
| PQ20 | Darran McLaughlin | Green New Deal |
| PQ21 | Kai Damani | Bristol Youth Strikes for Climate |
| PQ22 & PQ23 | Gerry Evans | Reusable Cans |

Within the time available, the Mayor responded verbally to questions PQ01, PQ02, PQ03, PQ04, PQ07 and PQ08 also responding to supplementary questions.

7. Petitions Notified by Councillors

None received.

8. Petition Debate - Pause Bristol's 5G Rollout

The Full Council considered a report of the Director – Legal and Democratic Services setting out details of a petition ‘Pause Bristol’s 5G Rollout’. The petition had reached the 3,500 signature threshold to qualify for a Full Council debate.

Sally Beare, the petition organiser, was invited by the Lord Mayor to present the objectives of the petition.

The Full Council then debated the petition.

Following the debate it was:

RESOLVED:

That the petition and the comment from the debate be noted and referred to the Mayor/ Cabinet Member for Transport, Energy and the Green New Deal for consideration and response.



9. Petition Debate - A Right to Shelter

The Full Council considered a report of the Director – Legal and Democratic Services setting out details of a petition ‘A Right to Shelter’. The petition had reached the 3,500 signature threshold to qualify for a Full Council debate.

Paul Blake, the petition organiser, was invited by the Lord Mayor to present the objectives of the petition.

The Full Council then debated the petition.

Following the debate it was:

RESOLVED:

That the petition and the comment from the debate be noted and referred to the Mayor/ Cabinet Member for Housing for consideration and response.

10. Report from Youth Mayors/ Youth Council on manifesto for year ahead

The Full Council received a progress report from the Youth Mayors and representatives of the Youth Council.

RESOLVED

That the report from the Youth Mayors and Youth Council be noted.

11. Report of the Independent Remuneration Panel

The Full Council received the report and recommendations of the Independent Remuneration Panel.

The Lord Mayor moved the report.

The Deputy Lord Mayor seconded the report.

The Chair of the Independent Remuneration Panel addressed Full Council.

There was no debate and it was:

RESOLVED

That the recommendations of the Independent Member Remuneration Panel be approved as set out in Appendix A.



An adjournment then followed, for 20 minutes.

12. Polling District Review

The Full Council considered a report asking Council to approve the polling districts and places for all wards in Bristol as listed in the appendix to the report.

The Lord Mayor moved the report and the recommendations set out therein.

The Deputy Lord Mayor seconded the report.

There was no debate and it was:

**RESOLVED:
That Council**

- 1. Approved the polling districts and places for all wards in Bristol as listed in the schedule of polling districts and polling places and shown in the ward maps.**
- 2. Noted the proposed polling stations for all Wards in Bristol.**

It was then moved by the Lord Mayor that standing order CPR9.1 be suspended to allow the meeting to go past the 2 hrs 30 time limit. Following a vote it was agreed to proceed until no later than 9.30pm.

13. Annual Report of the Audit Committee

The Full Council considered the annual report of the Audit Committee 2018-2019.

Councillor Mead moved the report and the recommendations contained therein.

Councillor Stevens seconded the report.

Following debate it was:

**RESOLVED:
That Council accept the report of the Audit Committee 2018-2019 and noted the Committee's concerns that internal control arrangements at the Council were not yet as robust as they should be. The Committee will continue to monitor and support improvement required during 2019/20.**

14. Updates to the Constitution



The Full Council considered the report.

Councillor Mead moved the report and the recommendations contained therein.

Councillor Stevens seconded the report.

There was no debate and it was:

RESOLVED:

That Council

- 1. Approved the updated Terms of Reference for the Audit Committee**
- 2. Adopted the Terms of Reference for the Health Scrutiny Sub Committee of the People Scrutiny Commission.**

15. Motions

Motion 1 – Green New Deal

Councillor Dudd moved the following motion:

Full Council notes:

1. The Paris Agreement, which recognises that we must keep global temperature rises below 1.5°C to prevent the worst effects of climate change; said accord's commitment by national governments to reduce carbon emissions, though by less than the ambitious targets set and brought forward by Bristol's Labour council – most recently to 2025.
2. The draft Local Plan's commitment to carbon neutral homes and development, together with successive investments by Labour budgets in renewable energy; lower-emissions vehicles for the authority, waste company, and Lord Mayor; progress towards a new recycling and reuse centre at Hartcliffe Way; low-carbon heat networks to tackle fuel poverty; insulating 20,000 council properties; and delivering renewable energy projects.
3. The Climate Emergency, which Bristol institutions have been the first in the country to declare and which Mayor Marvin Rees led 435 UK councils to declare via the Local Government Association; the climate protests sweeping this country including the youth strikes for climate and Extinction Rebellion and the increasingly widespread calls for a transformative Green New Deal to tackle the challenges that face us.
4. The radical carbon neutrality action plan, the Mayor's speech on Clean Air Day, Bus Deal negotiations, the £1 billion City Leap energy transformation programme, progressing plans for an underground/overground mass transit system, introduction of carbon budgeting, and establishment of



the One City Environment Board, advised by the expert Advisory Group on Climate Change; and the data set out within July's action plan, which shows that the city's consumption and imports make up ten times the emissions of aviation and shipping, and twice as much as electricity, gas, and transport.

5. The shadow Chancellor's plans to bring forward the Government's net-zero emissions target from 2050, invest £250 billion in a National Transformation Fund, ensure 60% of energy is from low or zero carbon sources by 2030, and raise research and development spending to 3% by of Gross Domestic Product by 2030.

Full Council believes:

1. As set out repeatedly by the Labour administration, social and environmental justice must go hand-in-hand – especially given the poorest suffer first and most from climate change and that the richest have carbon footprints four times larger than those of the poorest; and that cities have an increasingly crucial role in delivering on both fronts, as set out in the Global Parliament of Mayors' Bristol Declaration of 2018.
2. In the work being done by this council with partners to locally implement the United Nations' Sustainable Development Goals (UN SDGs), which recognise the interdependence of the Climate Emergency with simultaneous crises including poverty, housing, and health.
3. Deregulation and cuts to support for renewable energy by the Government have discouraged corporations away from reducing their dependence on dwindling and damaging fossil fuels.
4. A state-led green industrial revolution of investment, regulation, and partnerships would decarbonise and transform our economy, and limit global average temperature rises below 1.5°C
5. Bristol's world-famous aerospace sector, the birthplace of Concorde, should be at the forefront of decarbonising the aviation industry – increasing fuel efficiency advances and further accelerating the development of hybrid/electric planes.

Full Council resolves:

1. To restate the urgency of the Climate Emergency, and welcome declarations from the LGA and the West of England Combined Authority.
2. To back the One City Plan, aligned with the UN's SDGs, and to work towards delivering the Green New Deal locally where possible, as below.
3. To request that Party Group Leaders write to their respective national party leaders for their support with national legislation, regulation, and investment to enable the accelerated delivery of the Friends of the Earth asks and projects set out in 'Notes 4' together with the following local and national pledges which we would like to work towards and deliver:
 - a commitment to zero carbon emissions by 2030;
 - the rapid phase-out of all fossil fuels and a low-carbon transport integrated network for Bristol and the region;



- large scale investment in renewables;
- a just transition to well-paid, unionised, green jobs available for all, with skills (re-)training and support for the jobs of the present and future, together with workers' cooperatives and mutuals;
- a green industrial revolution expanding active workers' engagement, representation and consultation and public, democratic ownership as far as necessary for the transformation, green public integrated transport that connects Britain;
- support developing countries' climate transitions by increasing transfers of finance, technology, and capacity;
- assuring empowered communities and everyone's basic rights through the provision of universal services;
- and welcoming climate refugees while taking measures against the displacement of peoples from their home cities and countries and how that further compounds political and social instability.

Councillor Whittle seconded the motion.

Councillor Denyer moved the following amendment:

Full Council notes:

1. The Paris Agreement, which recognises that we must keep global temperature rises below 1.5°C to prevent the worst effects of climate change; said accord's commitment by national governments to reduce carbon emissions, and Bristol City Council's commitments to a carbon neutral council by 2025 and carbon neutral city by 2030.
2. The Council's draft Local Plan's commitment to carbon neutral homes and development, together with successive investments in renewable energy; lower-emissions vehicles; progress towards a new recycling and reuse centre at Hartcliffe Way; low-carbon heat networks to tackle fuel poverty; insulating 20,000 council properties; and the £1 billion City Leap energy transformation programme.
3. The Climate Emergency, which Bristol institutions have been the first in the country to declare; the climate protests sweeping this country including the youth strikes for climate and Extinction Rebellion.
4. The Mayor's response to the Climate Emergency, published in July 2019, which outlines initial proposals for further carbon reduction including the introduction of carbon budgeting, and establishment of the One City Environment Board, advised by the expert Advisory Group on Climate Change.
5. The shadow Chancellor's plans to bring forward the Government's net-zero emissions target from 2050, invest £250 billion in a National Transformation Fund, ensure 60% of energy is from low or zero carbon sources by 2030, and raise research and development spending to 3% by of Gross Domestic Product by 2030.
6. The concept of a 'Green New Deal', created in the UK by a multi-disciplinary group of experts in 2008 [1] and inspired by Franklin Roosevelt's New Deal of the 1930s, which aims to decarbonise the economy



and eradicate inequality through public investment, and the Decarbonisation and Economic Strategy Bill proposed in Parliament by Caroline Lucas MP and Clive Lewis MP to enact it.

Full Council believes:

1. Social and environmental justice must go hand-in-hand – especially given the poorest suffer first and most from climate change and that the richest have carbon footprints four times larger than those of the poorest; and that cities have an increasingly crucial role in delivering on both fronts, as set out in the Global Parliament of Mayors' Bristol Declaration of 2018.
2. In the work being done by this council with partners to locally implement the United Nations' Sustainable Development Goals (UN SDGs), which recognise the interdependence of the Climate Emergency with simultaneous crises including poverty, housing, and health.
3. Deregulation and cuts to support for renewable energy by the Government have discouraged corporations away from reducing their dependence on dwindling and damaging fossil fuels.
4. A state-led green industrial revolution of investment, regulation, and partnerships would decarbonise and transform our economy, and limit global average temperature rises below 1.5°C.
5. Bristol's world-famous aerospace sector, the birthplace of Concorde, should be at the forefront of decarbonising the aviation industry – increasing fuel efficiency advances and further accelerating the development of hybrid/electric planes. However, as such technological developments are still many years away and the percentage of the UK's emissions from aircraft is predicted to rise steeply [2], in the meantime there should be a moratorium on any further expansion of passenger capacity at airports (including at Bristol Airport).
6. That while proper funding and legislation to tackle the Climate Emergency are urgently needed from Central Government, there are still a lot of things that local government can do to start tackling climate change right now, such as the '33 actions' suggested by Friends of the Earth. [3]

Full Council resolves:

1. To restate the urgency of the Climate Emergency, and welcome declarations from the LGA and the West of England Combined Authority (WECA).
2. To back the One City Plan, aligned with the UN's SDGs, and to work towards delivering the Green New Deal locally where possible, as below.
3. To call on the Council administration to *begin* a Green New Deal for Bristol by committing to actions, as proposed by the Green New Deal group [1] and Friends of the Earth [3], that are currently within its powers, including:
 - Ensure that *every* decision made by the Council is commensurate with the Climate Emergency and UN SDGs by contributing to reductions in both greenhouse gas emissions *and* inequality;



- Use its influence on the multi-billion pound Avon Pension Fund to fully divest out of fossil fuels and into socially and environmentally beneficial investments such as renewable energy generation and low-carbon housebuilding, over the next five years;
- Begin work on a Congestion Charge or Workplace Parking Levy to raise funds and support cleaner, cheaper public transport;
- Oppose plans for new road capacity which inevitably leads to more traffic and carbon emissions;
- Build dozens of miles of cycling freeways and quietways across Bristol – by funding the cycling and pedestrian strategies that will improve quality of life and make it easier for people to get out of their cars;
- Stronger Local Plan policies and Council property management policies to ensure all new residential and commercial developments on private and Council land are ‘climate emergency-proof’;
- Work with WECA and North Somerset Council to *prioritise* the skills training and improve local supply chains to accelerate and enable the retrofitting for existing homes and buildings to become carbon neutral.

4. To request that Party Group Leaders write to their respective national party leaders for their support with national legislation, regulation, devolution and investment to enable the Council to carry out the other Green New Deal group [1] and Friends of the Earth [3] proposals, including:

- a commitment to zero carbon emissions by 2030;
- the rapid phase-out of all fossil fuels and fossil fuel infrastructure;
- a low-carbon transport integrated network for the whole of the UK;
- steps to tackle tax evasion and avoidance (which the Green New Deal group proposes would provide part of the funding for such a deal);
- a real reduction in emissions from our local airport;
- insulating every home and commercial building;
- large scale investment in renewables;
- more sustainable and local food production;
- a strengthening of the commons - natural and digital - to steward nature sustainably and ensure data and digital technologies are organised as a common resource to meet our needs;
- a just transition to well-paid, unionised, green jobs available for all, with skills (re-)training and support for the jobs of the present and future, together with workers’ cooperatives and mutuals;
- restructuring the economy and world of work through a green industrial strategy for more meaningful jobs and an expansion of leisure time, expanding active workers’ engagement, representation and consultation and public, democratic ownership;
- a reshaping and democratisation of the financial system to drive a step-change in investment and ensure its power serves the interests of people and planet;
- support developing countries’ climate transitions by increasing transfers of finance, technology, and capacity;



- assuring empowered communities and everyone’s basic rights through the provision of universal services;
- and welcoming climate refugees while taking measures against the displacement of peoples from their home cities and countries and how that further compounds political and social instability.

References:

1. <https://greennewdealgroup.org>
2. <https://www.ft.com/content/285d31c6-1fbe-11e9-b126-46fc3ad87c65>
3. <https://policy.friendsoftheearth.uk/insight/33-actions-local-authorities-can-take-climate-change>

Councillor Pearce raised a point of order CPR15.1 and 15.2. The Director of Legal and Democratic Services provided advice to the Lord Mayor and Full Council.

The amendment was seconded by Councillor Combley.

Following debate after being put to the vote, the amendment was LOST.

Upon moving to the vote on the original motion, it was CARRIED.

Full Council notes:

- 1. The Paris Agreement, which recognises that we must keep global temperature rises below 1.5°C to prevent the worst effects of climate change; said accord’s commitment by national governments to reduce carbon emissions, though by less than the ambitious targets set and brought forward by Bristol’s Labour council – most recently to 2025.**
- 2. The draft Local Plan’s commitment to carbon neutral homes and development, together with successive investments by Labour budgets in renewable energy; lower-emissions vehicles for the authority, waste company, and Lord Mayor; progress towards a new recycling and reuse centre at Hartcliffe Way; low-carbon heat networks to tackle fuel poverty; insulating 20,000 council properties; and delivering renewable energy projects.**
- 3. The Climate Emergency, which Bristol institutions have been the first in the country to declare and which Mayor Marvin Rees led 435 UK councils to declare via the Local Government Association; the climate protests sweeping this country including the youth strikes for climate and Extinction Rebellion and the increasingly widespread calls for a transformative Green New Deal to tackle the challenges that face us.**
- 4. The radical carbon neutrality action plan, the Mayor’s speech on Clean Air Day, Bus Deal negotiations, the £1 billion City Leap energy transformation programme, progressing plans for an underground/overground mass transit system, introduction of carbon budgeting, and establishment of the One City Environment Board, advised by the expert Advisory Group on Climate Change; and the data set out within July’s action plan, which shows that the city’s consumption and imports**



make up ten times the emissions of aviation and shipping, and twice as much as electricity, gas, and transport.

5. The shadow Chancellor's plans to bring forward the Government's net-zero emissions target from 2050, invest £250 billion in a National Transformation Fund, ensure 60% of energy is from low or zero carbon sources by 2030, and raise research and development spending to 3% by of Gross Domestic Product by 2030.

Full Council believes:

1. As set out repeatedly by the Labour administration, social and environmental justice must go hand-in-hand – especially given the poorest suffer first and most from climate change and that the richest have carbon footprints four times larger than those of the poorest; and that cities have an increasingly crucial role in delivering on both fronts, as set out in the Global Parliament of Mayors' Bristol Declaration of 2018.
2. In the work being done by this council with partners to locally implement the United Nations' Sustainable Development Goals (UN SDGs), which recognise the interdependence of the Climate Emergency with simultaneous crises including poverty, housing, and health.
3. Deregulation and cuts to support for renewable energy by the Government have discouraged corporations away from reducing their dependence on dwindling and damaging fossil fuels.
4. A state-led green industrial revolution of investment, regulation, and partnerships would decarbonise and transform our economy, and limit global average temperature rises below 1.5°C
5. Bristol's world-famous aerospace sector, the birthplace of Concorde, should be at the forefront of decarbonising the aviation industry – increasing fuel efficiency advances and further accelerating the development of hybrid/electric planes.

Full Council resolves:

1. To restate the urgency of the Climate Emergency, and welcome declarations from the LGA and the West of England Combined Authority.
2. To back the One City Plan, aligned with the UN's SDGs, and to work towards delivering the Green New Deal locally where possible, as below.
3. To request that Party Group Leaders write to their respective national party leaders for their support with national legislation, regulation, and investment to enable the accelerated delivery of the Friends of the Earth asks and projects set out in 'Notes 4' together with the following local and national pledges which we would like to work towards and deliver:
 - a commitment to zero carbon emissions by 2030;
 - the rapid phase-out of all fossil fuels and a low-carbon transport integrated network for Bristol and the region;
 - large scale investment in renewables;



- a just transition to well-paid, unionised, green jobs available for all, with skills (re-)training and support for the jobs of the present and future, together with workers' cooperatives and mutuals;
- a green industrial revolution expanding active workers' engagement, representation and consultation and public, democratic ownership as far as necessary for the transformation, green public integrated transport that connects Britain;
- support developing countries' climate transitions by increasing transfers of finance, technology, and capacity;
- assuring empowered communities and everyone's basic rights through the provision of universal services;
- and welcoming climate refugees while taking measures against the displacement of peoples from their home cities and countries and how that further compounds political and social instability.

Meeting ended at 9.30 pm

CHAIR _____

